

**WAYNE STATE UNIVERSITY – ACADEMIC SENATE**  
**Official Proceedings**  
**December 4, 2019**

---

Members Present: Keith Whitfield, Provost and Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs; Linda M. Beale, President of the Academic Senate; Faisal Almufarrej; Jocelyn Ang; Leela Arava; Paul Beavers; Juliann Binienda; Cathryn Bock; Timothy Bowman; Tamara Bray; Stephen Calkins; Leah Celebi; Wei Chen; Victoria Dallas; Susan Davis; Richard Dogan; Alan Dombkowski; Kelly Driscoll; Brian Edwards; Tom Fischer; Samiran Ghosh; Wanda Gibson-Scipio; Ewa Golebiowska; Daniel Golodner; Smiti Gupta; Xiaoyan Han; Robert Harr; Lance Heilbrun; Marisa Henderson; Peter Henning; renee hoogland; Michael Horn; Arun Iyer; Barbara Jones; David Kessel; Fayette Keys; Christine Knapp; Manoj Kulchania; Sarah Lenhoff; Krishna Rao Maddipati; David Merolla; Bharati Mitra; Santanu Mitra; Ekrem Murat; Sandra Oliver-McNeil; Victoria Pardo; Charles Parrish; Rachel Pawlowski; Richard Pineau; Leonidas Pittos; Avraham Raz; T.R. Reddy; Shauna Reeves; Robert Reynolds; Brad Roth; Krysta Ryzewski; Ali Salamey; Naida Simon; Elizabeth Stoycheff; Scott Tainsky; Ronald Thomas; Ellen Tisdale; William Volz; Jennifer Wareham; Robert D. Welch; Jeffrey Withey; Hossein Yarandi; Fu-Shin Yu; Yang Zhao

Members Absent with Notice: Poonam Arya; Ericka Bocknek; Pamela Dale; Kelly Dormer; Siobhan Gregory; Thomas Karr; Mahendra Kavdia; Sean Peters; Berhane Seyoum; Ricardo Villarosa

Members Absent: Kristen Kaszeta; Wen Li; Justin Long; Rayman Mohamed; Stella Resko

Others Present: Thomas Anderson, Liberal Arts and Sciences; Chirag Khimavat, Office of the Academic Senate; Amanda Levitt, Graduate Employees Organizing Committee; Mary Paquette-Abt, Fine, Performing and Communication Arts; Louis Romano, Liberal Arts and Sciences; Jack Sobel, Medicine; Karin Tarpinning, Liberal Arts and Sciences; Anita Welch, Education; Angela Wisniewski, Office of the Academic Senate

CALL TO ORDER: Provost Whitfield called this regularly scheduled meeting of the Academic Senate to order at 1:40 p.m. The meeting was held in the Bernath Auditorium in the Undergraduate Library.

I. APPROVAL OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE ACADEMIC SENATE

It was MOVED and SECONDED to APPROVE the Proceedings of the Academic Senate meeting of November 6, 2019. PASSED.

II. REPORT FROM THE CHAIR

Spirit of Community Award

Provost Whitfield reminded Senate members that nominations for the Spirit of Community Award are due on December 11. As stated in the announcement, the award recognizes faculty, staff, and students for their participation "in meaningful, sustainable and mutually beneficial relationships with our community." He urged Senate members to nominate persons who meet the qualifications.

Reviews of Schools and Colleges

The College of Nursing will be reviewed this year. The review committee is collecting data and expects to have its report completed by March 2020.

Graduate School

The search committee for the dean of the Graduate School has begun its work. We will not use a search firm. The Provost believes we'll be able to attract a strong diverse pool of candidates both externally and internally without the use of a search firm. The advertisement will be distributed early in the winter term.

Hiring of Faculty

Budget cuts have had to be made. The administration first tries to minimize the impact on the schools and colleges. Schools and colleges are able to hire faculty to replace those who retired or resigned so they can fulfill their academic mission. But the Provost has made up the budget shortfall by not authorizing the hiring of new faculty by the schools and colleges. He thinks there is enough money to hire five or six faculty on the broad interdisciplinary theme of social and behavioral determinants of health. Last year ten extraordinary faculty were hired focusing on the theme of big data and business analytics. A group of about 150 of our faculty who are interested in big data formed a community prior to the new faculty joining Wayne State in order to connect with the new hires. Ms. Wanda Gibson-Scipio serves on one of the committees reviewing the CVs of this year's applicants and prioritizing them based on qualifications, experience, etc. That committee has received about forty-three applications and they are still coming in. The committee on which Ms. Gibson-Scipio serves is reviewing applicants for only one part of the topic.

About 100 applications have been received for the entire topic. A community of our faculty is being formed around health issues to work with the new faculty that will be hired. There is some money for the teams to create research projects. The request for next year's interdisciplinary hiring will be sent to the deans soon. The interdisciplinary areas around which we hire faculty are where we have strengths or where we need to build.

Mr. Edwards noted that although about 70% of the university's research funding is in the medical school none of the faculty hired in the area of big data are in the school. He asked how many of the positions for the social and behavioral determinants of health would be in the medical school. Mr. Edwards's question, the Provost said, was college centric. That is not how the positions are filled. The evaluation committees judge the applicants based on their qualifications not on whether a college needs faculty. For this theme, one, or maybe both, of the review and evaluation committees has a representative from the medical school.

The Provost was also asked if the applicants were evaluated based on their potential to bring in research funding. He said that the committees reviewing the applicants are looking at scholarship and funded research. Some of the faculty who joined the university this year have funded research. The committees that review and evaluate applicants are judging their teaching, research, and service. The goal of interdisciplinary hiring is to build our teaching, research, and service across disciplines.

## II. MEDICAL SCHOOL UPDATE

Interim Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of the School of Medicine Jack Sobel thanked Ms. Beale for inviting him to address the Senate. Dr. Sobel has been dean for five years and one month. He expects to step down soon with the hiring of a new Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of Medicine. He'll return to his roles as clinician, researcher, and investigator. His most recent funding was for a five-year grant from NIH that expired this year.

Dr. Sobel has been on the faculty of the School of Medicine in the Department of Internal Medicine for 35 years. He was chief of the Division of Infectious Diseases for 26 years. He is proud that the division was ranked among the best nationally. He was appointed chair of the Department of Internal Medicine in 2014 and served in that position for only six months before being named dean of the school.

Dr. Sobel mentioned that he and Charles Parrish, the President of the AAUP-AFT, meet regularly and discuss issues involving the school. They resolve a

remarkable number of issues without filing grievances or having major confrontations. Mr. Parrish and Dean Sobel have the same goals and objectives. They have a constructive relationship although they have differences.

When Roy Wilson assumed the presidency of the university he realized that there were major problems in the school. Dr. Sobel met with him 18 months into his presidency. He told President Wilson that he had to rescue the school. Morale in the school was low; there were problems in the basic science departments and the academic medical center. In the 1990s the Detroit Medical Center (DMC) was an exceptional medical center, the best in southeast Michigan. It surpassed the Henry Ford Hospital System. Every clinical department competed with the University of Michigan. It was an academic medical center of excellence and it was a joy to work there. You interacted with outstanding clinicians who were at a level of clinical excellence. The clinicians practiced in a quality that impacts patient care and intellectual stimulation. That was before the Hunter Group arrived around 2000. The medical center was decimated, there were hundreds of layoffs and major attrition, and it never recovered.

There was tremendous deterioration under Mike Duggan, the current mayor of Detroit, when he became the chief executive officer of the medical center. Duggan was assisted by the poor leadership in the university and in the medical school dean's office. The deterioration continued after Mr. Duggan sold the non-profit DMC to the profit-making Vanguard Health Systems and then Vanguard sold it to Tenet Healthcare. The quality of care deteriorated: it was not what is expected of an academic medical center. Tenet had no interest in quality of care, academics, and research. Unfortunately, some of the deans of the medical school had a similar view. The medical school was in trouble.

Within three months of Dr. Sobel assuming the deanship, the LCME visited the school for its accreditation review. After 30 or 40 years of getting a clean bill of health at each review, the school escaped probation but the review was a disaster. The curriculum had not been changed in 20 years. Two basic science departments failed the review because no investment had been made in them: they were allowed to atrophy to an almost irreversible situation. The school had an \$8 million deficit. The morale in the basic science departments was low. There had been significant faculty attrition. The University Physician Group (UPG) was bankrupt. At the end of 2015 the UPG had a \$17 million deficit. At its inception, it had about 700 members. By 2015 it had just below 400 members. There was attrition of quality physicians. Above all, the

DMC implemented a policy some years prior to abandon patients in Detroit because many patients did not have insurance and could not pay for their medical care. The UPG ignored their responsibilities to the City of Detroit. They moved to the northern suburbs and leased multiple buildings.

The academic medical center was in decline and was not a pleasant place to work. In 1995 the Wayne State School of Medicine was ranked 22<sup>nd</sup> in the nation. By 2015 it was ranked 78<sup>th</sup>. Many urban-based public universities had surpassed us. We lost some very nationally prominent individuals. About 4,000 people applied to the Medical School per year. You can tell the quality of medical schools by the number of applicants and the quality of the applicants. We were flat for years. The Fund for Medical Research and Education was bankrupt. It owed the university \$39 million. The real tragedy was that the university didn't know it. Scott Hall is our largest medical school building, more than 60 years old and in terrible shape, with leaks from broken pipes and cold and ice. They have trouble controlling the pH of the laboratories. Eight departments underwent their five-year review. Every external review mentioned the poor conditions available for the basic science departments in Scott Hall. Three estimates to correct the problems in Scott Hall were all in excess of \$80 million.

For years when Mike Duggan was CEO of the DMC resources from the State of Michigan declined and there were decreased profits. The margins were minimal. Duggan declared war on the medical school and the school reciprocated. The situation was very unpleasant for people who worked in the school. It nearly destroyed the school. The school was massively under-resourced for many years. There was no money to replace the two failing departments. There were no hires in Dr. Sobel's first two years as dean. He declared a state of austerity to stabilize the situation. In his third year as dean, there were no additional cuts.

Now the school is fully accredited. In 2015 we admitted only one African-American student. By 2017 the number had increased to more than 45 African-American students. The school's new curriculum is in its 2<sup>nd</sup> year. This past year, 10,000 people applied to the school. This is an indication of the education we provide the medical students, the scores they get on the United States Medical Licensing Examination, as well as the results of their matching into residencies. Our medical school has more applicants than the University of Michigan's medical school.

The School of Medicine celebrated its 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary last year. A complete history of the school is contained in the book "Wayne State School of

Medicine: 150 years, 1868-2018" written by Professor Emeritus of Surgery Larry Stephenson, M.D. Dr. Sobel said Dr. Stephenson captured the last 20-30 years very well.

Dean Sobel believes the medical school is now very stable. The leadership team of vice deans is very strong and competent. None of them served in this capacity five years ago. The FMRE, which was essentially bankrupt, is now solvent due to strong leadership. We have a positive balance for the dean's tax. There has been an extraordinary turnaround in our relations with the various groups that contribute toward the dean's tax. The UPG emerged from Chapter 11 bankruptcy. It has new effective highly professional leadership. Most important it has a new strategy for growth. We sold the leases that were drowning the medical school in debt and have diminished, if not eradicated, the commitment to the suburbs. We have turned our attention to the City of Detroit, which needs our leadership and support in healthcare. The purchase of the building, 400 Mack Avenue, was critical to stabilize the learning space for the medical students, provide a place for ambulatory care for the medical students, and form a base for a new pediatrics department being established to replace University Pediatricians (UP). The university with UPG has leased the building for three years with the option to purchase it at the end of the three years. The building is critical to providing additional primary care that is absent in the city. The city's health department does not function effectively. The medical school is reorganizing the flow of funds and is developing a new physician compensation plan. They are instituting new methods of rewarding individuals for teaching that was not present in the past. They are linking teaching to excellence in a way that did not exist in the past.

Fifteen new basic scientists, who are mainly in the field of neurosciences, have been hired. Virtually all came with grants. We have a new department of neurology and an outstanding department of psychiatry. Together the departments launched the neuroscience research institute. Morale and research productivity have improved and we have fewer unproductive faculty.

Dean Sobel next spoke about the problems in the school. There are many leaking lines in Scott Hall. There are major problems with the elevators so that people regularly walk up nine flights of stairs. A contract has been signed to replace the eight elevators in Scott Hall. The changes in technology in medicine and in teaching methods and the move from a hospital-based system to an ambulatory-care system require that we change the format. The school has three very large lecture halls but students can now stream the lectures. The DMC has not changed. It has not reverted to a high quality academic medical center.

That cannot happen when hospitals are owned by individuals or by an entity that is only interested in profits. Tenet contributes nothing to research and is constantly fighting the medical school to outsource all activities. The covenant that was created for the for-profit entity expires in 2020. The DMC hospital system is the most profitable unit in the entire Tenet system and Tenet takes out between \$200 and \$250 million every year. That money goes to the shareholders instead of going to the medical school or to research and education. After 2020, Tenet will be able to breakup and sell parts or all of the hospital system. They are likely to sell Children's Hospital first and then the Rehabilitation Institute. The DMC will not again be a partner with the medical school as it was prior to privatization. The UPG emerged from bankruptcy but it doesn't have the resources to do the massive hiring that is needed. It needs an infusion of money. Dean Sobel believes that funding will come with the appointment of the new dean.

Dean Sobel noted his fears about the University of Michigan's actions in connection with Detroit, the DMC, and the medical school. The University of Michigan raids our faculty all the time: a faculty member with an RO1 grant will automatically be on U of M's list of prospective faculty. U of M was actively involved in the crisis with UP, undermining a sister institution by making every effort to capture our pediatric faculty. U of M wants to grow. It has been unsuccessful expanding on the west side of the state. They now see that Detroit is an area of growth. U of M has great resources. If Tenet sells Children's Hospital in the next year, U of M will be first in line. They think nothing of allowing Wayne State's School of Medicine to disappear. Another major issue is the problem with University Pediatricians, the UP, which is the practice plan for the pediatricians. The university and the medical school have no control over the admission of patients to Children's Hospital, and there is a small group of dissident individuals in the UP who have been enabled by the DMC to act contrary to WSU's interests. If the DMC sells Children's Hospital in a year's time they will sell the hospital and its clinical staff arrangements, so they do not want the clinical staff to have any allegiance to Wayne State. They have made it impossible for Wayne State to come to terms with the UP. The case is in court now. The solution underway is to establish a new WSU department of pediatrics. Pediatric training is changing to ambulatory care [rather than the specialty care at Children's] so that is the type of program that is being developed.

The School of Medicine remains under-resourced. Research is expensive. We have outstanding investigators and areas of excellence that need to be funded.

Dr. Sobel believes President Wilson correctly diagnosed the problems in the medical school and that the failure to merge with the Henry Ford Health System was a tragedy. Wayne State needs a new partner. It is critical to the education of our students. It was critical and valuable for WSU and HFHS to combine research. Henry Ford has more than \$80 million in NIH funding. Negotiations to merge research activities would not be a problem. The problem would be at the clinical level because the two institutions have always competed with each other. The proposal was for a two-campus clinical model. Wayne State would retain the DMC as the campus for clinical operations and teaching. There have been claims that the university was giving away the medical school to Henry Ford. The medical school was never discussed in the negotiations. There were differences in how to combine clinical departments. UPG has 300 physicians. Henry Ford has 2,000. The clinical care at Henry Ford is vastly superior to that available now at the DMC. This was not true in the 1980s and 1990s. The two institutions talked about partnerships with eighteen clinical departments, six would be chaired by a physician from Henry Ford, six would be chaired by a physician from Wayne State, and national searches would be carried out for the other six departments. The rejection of the plan was a major blow to the school of medicine. Experts who worked with national mergers assisted the university in developing the best possible model for a limited liability company for a health sciences center.

The university is in the final stage in the search for a new vice president for health affairs and dean of the medical school. That individual would be responsible for clinical affiliations for the College of Nursing, the School of Social Work, and the Eugene Applebaum College of Pharmacy and Health Sciences in addition to acting as dean for the School of Medicine. Those colleges combined with the Institute of Gerontology, other public health institutes, and the medical aspects in other colleges form a significant health care entity. We can apply the knowledge and skills in these colleges and departments to aid the residents of Detroit. President Wilson and Dean Sobel are committed to helping the city.

The Dean noted that in his opinion the breakdown of the negotiations between Wayne State and HFHS had negatively affected the medical school after the impasse between President Wilson and the two factions on the Board of Governors. It has also affected philanthropy and may make recruitment of a new dean more difficult. It is an existential threat to the medical school.

Part of the cause of the impasse is controversy about the use of the revenue the university receives from the Medicaid Public Entity Physician Payment Adjust

Program (PEPPAP). The clinicians who treat Medicaid patients earn the money. Wayne State, the University of Michigan, and Michigan State University all make institutional adjustments with that money, indirectly using the funds to further healthcare. It may not be on a patient-doctor basis. There are many ways the money can be invested, such as creating a new clinic. Various attorneys, including in connection with the UPG bankruptcy, have reviewed the university's use of the PEPPAP money without finding improper use.

The future of the medical school, Dean Sobel said, is not guaranteed. It is stable, but to thrive it needs a new partnership and additional investment, which requires resolution of the current Board of Governors discord.

Dean Sobel took questions from the members.

Ms. Davis asked if there was a bright side to the situation. She thinks there might be aspects of the plan that are salvageable in a relationship with Henry Ford Hospital. Dean Sobel said that we would not be able to pick up the relationship where we left off. There is a significant amount of research between the two institutions and our medical students continue to be placed at HFH. All the chairs of the clinical departments and of other departments at HFH were in favor of the partnership.

Mr. Parrish thanked Dr. Sobel for his presentation; it was informative. He acknowledged that the problems are extremely difficult. At the September Senate meeting, Mr. Parrish said, President Wilson talked about how wonderful everything was at the university and that Wayne State was ranked 69<sup>th</sup> of 400 research universities and research expenditures were pretty good. However, Mr. Parrish continued, when President Wilson came to Wayne, we were ranked 52<sup>nd</sup>. Referring to the university's research ranking, Mr. Parrish said that our research has been flat for the last five years. It appears to have improved because Vice President for Research Stephen Lanier counted the \$40 million in drug research at the Karmanos Cancer Institute in the university's research statistics but that money is not new; it had been at the university. Mr. Parrish further noted that there always are politics in the board of every university. It is the duty of the president of the institution to manage the board. Mr. Parrish was very enthusiastic when President Wilson came to Wayne State. He agreed with his assessment of the issues facing the university. The problem, Mr. Parrish said, was that there was never an effort to enlist the tenured faculty of the medical school in solving the issues (about thirty 12-month faculty in the medical school had full tenure). Mr. Parrish suggested that the problems in the medical school worsened under former Vice President for Health Affairs David

Hefner, who created unnecessary tension among faculty. It is a university president's responsibility to manage a university's governing board. Mr. Parrish noted that he has seen many boards but this is the first time he has seen this type of conflict among our Board members, going on for so long. The university, Parrish said, would eventually move forward, but it is unwise to consider reverting to the letter of intent signed with HFHS in September 2018. There are many other relationships that could be developed for the two institutions, but we have to get consensus at the board level and that is the responsibility of the President.

### III. REPORT FROM THE SENATE PRESIDENT

#### A. Report and Announcements

Ms. Beale updated the Senate members about recent issues that Policy Committee has discussed.

#### Pay Equity

The Gender Pay Gap Analysis Subcommittee of the Gender Equity Working Group completed its work. They submitted the report to the Policy Committee and to the AAUP-AFT (Appendix A) for review and suggestions. Policy Committee supported many of the subcommittee's recommendations, but was concerned about some of the recommendations, especially the one suggestion creation of another administrative group to deal with this issue in the future, rather than using the institution's existing governance processes--especially those in the collective bargaining agreement for salary merit increases--to establish greater equity.

#### Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of the Medical School

Ms. Beale was a member of the search committee for the Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of the School of Medicine. It was, she said, a good process in which the faculty on the committee worked together to ensure a good pool of candidates. She admitted that she was initially skeptical about the new position, but now sees it is as an opportunity to bring fresh perspectives to the issues in the medical school that will result in positive changes while addressing the need for inter-professional relationships among all the health affairs schools.

#### Responsibility Centered Management

The most recent update on the responsibility centered management (RCM) budget model is in the November 6 Senate Proceedings. The Senate

has been assured that the broader university community will see the unit RCM analyses early in the winter term. Both the Graduate Council and the Policy Committee were pleased that, although the graduate research assistantship and graduate teaching assistantship funding will be in the individual schools and colleges, it will be maintained in separate accounts. It can be used only to support graduate education. It cannot be used for other expenses.

#### Warrior VIP

The Warrior Vision and Impact Program (VIP) is a support program for first generation, black, and/or low-income students. It began in fall 2017 with a cohort of 74 students, 50 of whom are black. The retention rate for the 2018 cohort from first year to second year is 74.0% for black students in the VIP and 75.0% for black students in the VIP who also took the first year seminar. The retention rate for black students in the 2017 cohort from the second year to the third year is 78.0% and 83.3% for the black students in that cohort who also took the first year seminar. The retention rate for all entering students in the 2017 cohort is 69.1%. The retention rate of the second cohort, i.e., students entering in fall 2018, may not be as good because of the need for additional staffing. Although the number of students in the program is fairly small it is good to see that we are providing the kind of resources that students need to succeed.

#### The Board of Governors

Ms. Beale reviewed meetings and events related to the schism among Board members and President Wilson. At its meeting of December 7, 2018, the Board of Governors approved an early extension of President Wilson's contract with a compensation increase by a vote of 5 to 3. This action was controversial because David Nicholson and Diane Dunaskiss, who lost their bids for re-election to the Board, approved the contract extension at their last meeting as members, along with Kim Trent, Mark Gaffney, and Marilyn Kelly. Voting against the extension were Michael Busuito, Sandra Hughes O'Brien, and Dana Thompson. At an executive committee meeting in February 2019, the Board passed a motion to fire Vice President for Health Affairs David Hefner by a vote of 6 to 2. Board members had to file a FOIA request to get information about Mr. Hefner's contractual arrangement because President Wilson would not give it to them. The Board split 4 to 4 on a motion to approve the letter of intent with the Henry Ford Health System that would have moved various functions, mostly related to the clinical practice and Wayne State's

research institutes, to a new independent board created under a limited liability company. The letter of intent provided for the President, Vice President for Research, and other members of the administration—but not Wayne State's Board of Governors—to participate in the selection of the head of the company's board. Reading the letter as an attorney, Ms. Beale admitted that the letter had provisions that she considered to raise significant concerns.

More or less at the same time, UP, the clinical practice plan for the pediatricians, moved to Central University Michigan because of a dispute with President Wilson and, in part, with the School of Medicine. It became a personal dispute between the leaders of the UP and President Wilson and the SOM that included the arrangements for the clinicians and the use of the PEPPAP Medicaid payments. The university's use of the PEPPAP funding, as Dr. Sobel stated, has been reviewed externally and has been found to be proper. Ms. Beale noted that information about the use of the funds has not been reported or discussed at meetings that Senate members attend and it is not clear how the entire funding reserved as institutional adjustments has been used.

At the March 22 Board of Governors meeting, Governors Sandra O'Brien, Dana Thompson, and Michael Busuito made individual statements calling for President Wilson to resign. They complained about lack of transparency, lack of consultation, and lack of respect. A small group of community activists spoke at the end of the meeting in support of President Wilson. Ms. Beale noted that those community activists were very disruptive by yelling during the meeting, standing, moving around, and shaking their fists. (They had also shouted that they intended to "impeach" Busuito, Thompson and O'Brien as those members were talking.) These disturbances were allowed to take place without comment from the President as chair.

At the June 21 Board meeting, one of the members of the group that opposes the President was out of town on a trip that had been planned long before his election to the Board. At the last minute three of the eight members of the Board decided to boycott the meeting to prevent a quorum, in part to protest the placing of the purchase of the building at 400 Mack Avenue on the agenda of the executive committee. The Board had rejected that action in the past. In response to the boycott, the four other elected members of the Board and President Wilson, who is a non-voting ex-officio member of the Board by virtue of his office, claimed that the President could be counted for the Board's quorum.

This contrasted with the practice and policy in the past, when the Board Secretary called the names of the elected members of the Board and then announced that there was a quorum. All of the matters before the Board passed with the four votes of the elected members who were present. The four Board members who did not attend that meeting sued over the quorum issue. That is still in litigation.

On October 23, a media event was held to announce the new Heart of Detroit Tuition Pledge program. Although it appears that plans for the program began at least as early as April 2019, no members of the Board of Governors except for Kim Trent, the chair of the Board, knew about the program. The program, which offers free tuition to students who live in Detroit or who graduate from Detroit high schools, appears to be a major budget and educational policy change but was not discussed with the full Board or with the Senate Budget Committee or Senate Policy Committee. The other Board members were informed about the program less than two hours before the media event. The Board members were not pleased with the event and on October 28, Secretary to the Board of Governors Julie Miller sent an email to Board members that Board Chair Trent had asked that a special executive committee meeting be set up and suggested that it be held on October 30. A few minutes later, a second email was sent suggesting that the special meeting be appended to a health affairs committee meeting already scheduled for November 4. Seven of the eight members of the Board attended the November 4 meeting. After some discussion of the Heart of Detroit program, a motion was made to allow President Wilson to resign by the end of November 5 or be fired. The motion was seconded and passed by 4 yes votes. It has been claimed that some Board members had left before the vote took place. Others claim that all seven members were present for the vote. [Note: there is a video showing all were present.] On November 5, Governor Trent sent a statement to the university community that a special executive committee meeting had not been called, that there was no vote to fire the President, that the President did not plan to resign, and that he had the full support of the Chair and the Vice Chair Marilyn Kelly.

Attached to these Senate Proceedings as Appendix B are: the email message of November 5 from BOG Chair Kim Trent to all employees; Governor Busuito's statement of November 14; President Wilson's statement of November 20; and a statement of November 22 from Governor Trent to

the Policy Committee in response to Governor Busuito's statement of November 14.

Ms. Beale said that she agrees with Dean Sobel that there is an existential threat to the School of Medicine. The President and the factions of the Board of Governors appear to be in irreconcilable conflict. Governors Trent, Kelly, Gaffney, and Barnhill appear to support President Wilson. Governors Busuito, O'Brien, Kumar, and Thompson appear to have lost all faith in the President. President Wilson has said that he does not intend to resign and has treated the vote of November 4 as invalid. The conflict between the factions of the Board and the President has been reported extensively by local and national media. Faculty, students, staff, alumni, and members of the community have raised questions about the future of the university in this context if this schism continues until November 2020 when the terms of two members of the Board of Governors expire and for which an election will be held to fill the positions.

Ms. Beale believes that all of the people involved in this conflict are at fault. Both factions of the Board and the President are at fault. A situation where you have this kind of schism and public derogation of the university is extraordinarily harmful to the university. The members of the Board who oppose the President are being criticized directly, in ways that apparently involve press releases and rallies conducted to show support for President Wilson. Incredibly, at least one current high-ranking university official made an anonymous complaint to our accrediting body claiming a conflict of interest by members of the Board who do not support President Wilson. The question of the BOG votes of June 21<sup>st</sup> and November 4<sup>th</sup> go to the core of the legality and functionality of the university administration. The courts have not definitively decided if there was a quorum on June 21 or whether the vote on November 4 was valid, but there are certainly plausible legal arguments that there was no quorum and that there was a vote at a valid special executive committee meeting.

Every year the Senate Budget Committee invites the Vice President for Development and Alumni Affairs to a meeting to discuss issues related to fundraising. Vice President Susan Davis told the committee that fundraising on behalf of the medical school, which generally constitutes 25% of the university's total fundraising, is down to about 11%. Ms. Beale has heard from other people that fundraising in the other schools and colleges is similarly affected. Major donors are not willing to contribute to the university. People who are asked

to support the university in other ways question whether their doing so is worth their effort.

Ms. Beale noted she wanted to be clear that she was strongly supportive of President Wilson when he arrived. She, along with most people with whom she has talked, strongly agree that Wayne State needs multiple partners for the medical school and that a partnership with Henry Ford Health System is essential to counteract the negatives of the current relationship with Tenet Healthcare. Ms. Beale had expected the President to be very supportive of shared governance but over the past year to two years, she has felt that the Senate was not respected because his administration has repeatedly failed to consult on key educational policy issues. One major educational policy decision was the merger of the position of vice president for health affairs and dean of the medical school. Within a few months of his arrival, the President organized an administrative task force to look at the issue. The task force was composed of seven administrators and one faculty member from the medical school selected by the President. Neither the Policy Committee nor, to her knowledge, faculty or governance committees in the medical school knew the change was under discussion. After the announcement of the search, President Wilson invited Ms. Beale to a meeting, the first in two years, to discuss this and other matters, and they agreed that it was important to continue meeting.

Vice President Hefner was a major negative factor in the morale within the School of Medicine that resulted in the loss of some of our most productive faculty. If a faculty member who has an RO1 grant is offered a position at the University of Michigan and Wayne State is in the process of detouring faculty, that detouring process might be a factor in accepting the offer. Ms. Beale thinks the effort to increase faculty productivity could have been handled in a much more felicitous manner.

The Heart of Detroit Tuition Pledge program, which has implications for budgetary support and for instruction because of a potential increase in enrollment, was announced without consultation with the Senate or the Board of Governors. The Warrior VIP with very small cohorts has been successful but such programs require funding.

Discussions with medical school faculty and in particular with those in pediatrics have pointed out President Wilson's mishandling of issues around the UP clinicians, in particular the issuance of ultimatums that irritated and ultimately antagonized the leadership of the UP and led to many of our

most productive pediatricians reluctantly planning to go with UP to CMU rather than lose their ability to practice in Children's Hospital.

The Policy Committee used to meet with the President's Cabinet twice per year, but those meetings were cancelled after the first year of Wilson's presidency.

There has been no public follow up to the censure motions that the Senate passed on May 8 and October 2. One would expect the President, at the least, to send a message to the Senate acknowledging receipt of the actions taken and appreciating the gravity of such actions. Ms. Beale did attend a meeting of the audit committee of the Board of Governors regarding the auditing of an employee by the Office of Internal Audit. President Wilson expressed directly to Ms. Beale his intense anger that she was present. Many members of the President's Cabinet were at the meeting. It was a very unpleasant meeting. Associate Vice President and Chief Audit Executive Carolyn Hafner insisted that she always followed due process although Ms. Beale pointed out three actions that were not consistent with due process. Board of Governors members of the Audit Committee told Ms. Beale that after she left the meeting Ms. Hafner admitted she had not followed due process, begged forgiveness, and said she would always do so in the future. Recently Ms. Hafner has been elevated to the position of Interim Associate Vice President for Human Resources. Furthermore, the President consistently discourages Board members from talking to Senate members or allowing the Senate President, Vice Chair, or Policy Committee to attend the Board's executive committee meetings. However, sometimes the full President's Cabinet attends those meetings. Ms. Beale finds this disrespectful of shared governance.

Ms. Beale ended by saying that she thinks the university is in a very fragile situation that will continue until the issues between the President and the Board are resolved.

Ms. Simon asked to be recognized. She made the following statement:

As a long-time member of the university community and a professional (I like to think of myself as a consummate professional) it is not my practice to ignore a request from a member of the Board of Governors. This morning I received an email message from one of the Governors asking me to read something to you. After the salutation, I will begin with his last sentence.



Hello Naida,

I know that you have a senate meeting today, please feel free to let the senate know my thoughts.

I have been on the Board of Governors now since January. I have done an extensive analysis of the problems between the Board and the President. It appears that the President's behavior concerning the Board is irreversibly unchangeable.

The effect of his behavior is detrimental to the students and faculty of Wayne State University. After two retreats and numerous discussions, we have not noticed any hope for change that will alter our path and prevent the destruction of the university. We have, after much thought and deliberation, decided during our last meeting to let the President go.

I hope that the students and the faculty will now voice their opinion. If their sentiment and that of the faculty senate matches our conclusion, then now is the time to take a stand. I am hoping that the faculty will consider our action as the initiation of the process, but we will now count on the strength of the senate and students to enable the university to function appropriately once again.

Best regards,  
Dr. Anil Kumar

Ms. Simon reminded the people present that she is the chosen messenger and not the author.

#### B. Proceedings of the Policy Committee

The Senate received the proceedings of the Policy Committee meetings of November 4 and November 11, 2019 (Appendix C).

##### November 11, 2019

Referring to item #1 Mr. Pineau asked for clarification about the services that Bartleby Learn (BL) provides students and its support by the Barnes & Noble Bookstore. Ms. Beale responded. At the Policy Committee meeting Timothy Michael, the Associate Vice President for Student Auxiliary Services, stated that students "cannot ask a question in Bartleby and get the solution." Mr. Pineau had understood that the purpose of BL was to give students the answers to their questions. He was very concerned that the bookstore was offering a service that tutoring could not offer and that the

bookstore staff had decided this was a good service for students. He asked what credentials the bookstore personnel have to make such a determination.

Ms. Beale responded. Ms. Jodi Young, the manager of the bookstore, and Mr. Michael told the Policy Committee that they would give Policy and other committees access to use BL as students use it in order to assess the service, but Policy has not yet received that access. Mr. Pineau said the members of the Curriculum and Instruction Committee also have not yet received access. Ms. Beale said that Policy was told that BL operates 24/7, but Mr. Michael said that it might take up to 48 hours for a student to get a response. It therefore seems possible, Ms. Beale noted, that a student could get an answer while taking an exam. Policy was told that BL gives students the steps they should follow to get the answer to their questions but not the answers. Policy told Mr. Michael and Ms. Young that they should have consulted faculty before making Bartleby Learn available to students and promoting it. It directly impacts how students deal with classwork and Policy is concerned about it being incentivized in this manner.

Mr. Michael and Ms. Young said that the Student Success Center (SSC) supported Bartleby Learn. However, Policy Committee met with Michele Bruner on December 2. Ms. Bruner is incredibly knowledgeable. She answered questions with a clear understanding of how the SSC was working with students. In essence Ms. Bruner said that the SSC did not advocate for students' using BL. She understood that the bookstore was offering something to students when the SSC was not open. Policy Committee will follow up with the bookstore after members have had a chance to see how the system operates. Policy Committee was told that the information available on BL was from experts in their field, but when Ms. Hoogland looked at the website, she found essays written by students. Having essays available raises the question of plagiarism. The bookstore is offering \$5,000 worth of incentives for students to sign up for the service. If they want to continue using it, they will pay \$10 per month. Students may assume that if the university bookstore promotes Bartleby Learn, that the university and its faculty approve of its use.

#### IV. NEW BUSINESS

Members expressed concern and confusion about the votes taken regarding the President at different meetings of the Board of Governors. People are asking whether or not Wayne State has a president and whether votes were valid. Ms. Beale thinks the

uncertainty about the status of the President is why Governor Kumar asked Ms. Simon to read his statement. Governor Kumar thinks that if the faculty and the Student Senate express their concerns that will lead to progress in resolving the stalemate. Ms. Beale does not know the process for determining whether a particular vote was valid or not, though there may be outreach from the Administration or Board to the Attorney General's office.

Provost Whitfield mentioned that the Board of Governors would hold its regularly scheduled meeting on December 6. Perhaps the status of the votes will be clarified at that meeting. Both sides took actions to move their personal agendas forward. Some issues are in litigation. The courts will have to decide the legality of the votes. The Provost cautioned the Senate to hear presentations from both sides of the controversy before taking action. Sometimes the negative side is the loudest. Decisions should be made based on all the available information.

Ms. Beale stated that she had been careful to ensure that all the information she presented was factual, because she believed that Senators should know as much as possible about the situation. Nonetheless, the Provost suggested the information was incomplete and included statements that Board members had made about irreconcilable differences. The Provost suggested such issues have to be resolved at the Board level, and not by the other levels that are impacted by Board actions. The Board is managed by the Chair and the Vice Chair with participation from all its members. He thinks the university is struggling with two perspectives. One is that it is doing some things better than it has ever done.

Mr. Parrish commented. Although he could question some of Dean Sobel's remarks, it was the most honest and straightforward presentation that could be expected from the Dean's perspective. Mr. Parrish also noted that Ms. Beale presented a straightforward statement about the conflict among the Board members. But he has not seen any statements from President Wilson about his position on the issues. It appears to Mr. Parrish that the supporters of the President view the situation as a public relations operation. Rather, he said, it is about the leadership and the future of the university. We have to have positive policies to solve problems. Various people have responsibilities, but the Board, he said, is managed by the President, not by its Chair. A president always manages a university board. If the president does not manage the board, it is his fault regardless of whether it's fair. The Chairs of our Board of Governors have one-year terms. Presidents come and presidents go. We, he said, have a collective institutional responsibility to ensure the future of the

university. If faculty are not consulted, there are consequences for that.

Mr. Harr asked about the data on the Warrior VIP, wondering whether the changes were statistical fluctuation. Ms. Beale responded that the different retention numbers are for each of the cohorts and thus in different years so they may not be comparable.

Provost Whitfield noted that he understood Ms. Beale's point to be that we should find out what in the Warrior VIP is successful and if we can scale it. At the Policy Committee meeting, Ms. Bruner said that one of the reasons for the small downturn in the second cohort might be that the program has grown to the point where they need additional staff to meet the students' needs. They are doing more with the same number of people they had when there were fewer students in the program. The program is making a difference because the retention rate is better than for our overall population.

Mr. Parrish pointed out that the retention rates are better but they are very small. The tuition-free Heart of Detroit Tuition Pledge program will just top up the tuition payments and will affect fewer than 200 people. He views this type of program as mostly public relations. This university administration, he said, has cut the number of African-American students in half.

Provost Whitfield objected to Mr. Parrish's comments. Cutting means there was the desire or the intent to reduce the number of students. That, he said, is not true. The number of African-American students is lower because under an earlier administration many students were admitted that did not meet the admission standards. They were left with debt but no degree. The idea that there is some intent to keep African-American students out is absolutely wrong. There is no basis and no intent that supports that supposition. When the admission standards were enforced (and that change occurred under a previous administration) the number of students went down. However, the number of African-American students has been trending up lately. The Provost added that Wayne State is not the only university trying to recruit African-American students from Detroit. The University of Michigan, Central Michigan University, and Saginaw State University have a presence in Detroit partly for the purpose of recruiting top African-American students.

Mr. Parrish responded that he has complained for many years that the university needs to commit more resources to students who need additional support to be successful. We had the opportunity to help 8,000 African-American students in 2005 compared to 4,000 today. The university, he said, does not have a plan to

tackle the problem except to have small symbolic programs.

Mr. Raz expressed concern about the university's ability to recruit good faculty in the present circumstances. The Provost said that good scholars are interested in coming to Wayne. Wayne State is still a great university. People are looking for opportunities and Wayne State offers opportunities. We've had issues in the past, and we're experiencing some trouble now but we will survive. Provost Whitfield said that is why he and members of the President's Cabinet are consulting more. They have not always been successful but there is more consultation.

Ms. Beale agreed. Provost Whitfield, she said, has included the Senate and urged others to include the faculty voice in consultation and decision-making processes. It doesn't always happen but the Provost has made a difference. Provost Whitfield commented that the inclusion of the faculty voice has resulted in better decisions. The university, he added, is evolving and good faculty are willing to join the university.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 3:48 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Linda M. Beale  
President, Academic Senate

